

EXHIBIT 16

Brian D. Penny
Goldman Scarlato & Penny, P.C.
161 Washington Street, Suite 1025
Conshohocken, PA 19428
Telephone: (484) 342-0700
Facsimile: (484) 580-8747

Counsel for Indirect Purchaser Plaintiffs

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
OAKLAND DIVISION

**IN RE: LITHIUM ION BATTERIES
ANTITRUST LITIGATION**

Case No. 13-MD-02420 YGR (DMR)

MDL NO. 2420

This Document Relates to:
ALL INDIRECT PURCHASER ACTIONS

**DECLARATION OF BRIAN D. PENNY IN
SUPPORT OF INDIRECT PURCHASER
PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR AN
AWARD OF ATTORNEYS' FEES AND
REIMBURSEMENT OF EXPENSES ON
BEHALF OF GOLDMAN SCARLATO &
PENNY, P.C.**

I, Brian D. Penny, declare:

1. I am a shareholder of Goldman Scarlato & Penny, P.C. ("GSP"), Counsel for Indirect Purchaser Plaintiffs ("IPPs" or "Plaintiffs") in this action. I submit this declaration in support of IPPs' Motion for an Award of Attorneys' Fees and Reimbursement of Expenses. I make this declaration based on my personal knowledge and if called as a witness, I could and would competently testify to the matters stated herein.

2. My firm has served as counsel to Rebecca Cohen, Dan Wehking, Steven Wiley, Ellis Greenspan, Grace Shire, Louis Messina, Patrice Nealon, Marylin Sharp, Dawn Potvin (Hall),
**DECLARATION OF B IN SUPPORT OF IPPS' MOTION FOR AN AWARD OF
ATTORNEYS' FEES AND REIMBURSEMENT OF EXPENSES ON BEHALF OF GOLDMAN
SCARLATO & PENNY, P.C.; No. 13-md-02420-YGR (DMR)**

1 and Elizabeth Porter and as counsel for IPPs throughout the course of this litigation. The
2 background and experience of GSP and its attorneys are summarized in the curriculum vitae
3 attached hereto as **Exhibit A**.

4 3. GSP has prosecuted this litigation solely on a contingent-fee basis, and has been at
5 risk that it would not receive any compensation for prosecuting claims against the defendants.
6 While GSP devoted its time and resources to this matter, it has foregone other legal work for
7 which it would have been compensated.

8 4. During the pendency of the litigation, GSP performed the following work: review
9 and coding of documents and quality control review of documents coded by other attorneys in this
10 matter, all as directed by Lead Counsel.

11 5. Attached hereto as **Exhibit B** is a billing summary of GSP'S total hours and
12 lodestar, computed at current billing rates, from June 1, 2013 to February 28, 2017. Counsel for
13 Plaintiffs are not seeking attorneys' fees for any time billed prior to the appointment of lead
14 counsel. *See* Order dated May 17, 2013 (ECF No. 194). The total number of hours spent by GSP
15 during this period of time was 470.5, with a corresponding lodestar based on current rates of
16 \$165,457.00. The lodestar amount reflected in Exhibit B is for work assigned by Lead Counsel,
17 and was performed by professional staff hired by my law firm. This summary was prepared from
18 contemporaneous, daily time records regularly prepared and maintained by GSP.

19 6. Attached hereto as **Exhibit C** is a list of the various billing rates each attorney and
20 staff member at my firm has billed at in this case.

21 7. Attached hereto as **Exhibit D** is a compilation of my firm's detailed records at
22 historical billing rates. The entries in **Exhibit D** have been redacted per the Court's Order in ECF
23 No. 1803.

24 8. GSP is not seeking any reimbursement for the expenses we incurred in this matter.

25 9. I have reviewed the time records reported by GSP in this case, which are included
26 in this declaration, and I affirm that they are true and accurate.

1 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States that the foregoing is
2 true and correct.

3 Executed on May 24, 2017 at Conshohocken, PA.

4
5 */s/ Brian D. Penny*

6 _____
Brian D. Penny
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27

28
DECLARATION OF BRIAN D. PENNY IN SUPPORT OF IPPS' MOTION FOR AN AWARD
OF ATTORNEYS' FEES AND REIMBURSEMENT OF EXPENSES ON BEHALF OF
GOLDMAN SCARLATO & PENNY, P.C.; Case No. 13-md-02420-YGR (DMR)

ATTESTATION

I, Steven N. Williams, hereby attest, pursuant to United States District Court, Northern District of California Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), that concurrence to the filing of this document has been obtained from the signatory hereto.

By: /s/ Steven N. Williams

Steven N. Williams

EXHIBIT A

EXHIBIT A

GOLDMAN, SCARLATO & PENNY, P.C.

Eight Tower Bridge, Suite 1025
161 Washington Street
Conshohocken, PA 19428
(484) 342-0700

GOLDMAN SCARLATO & PENNY, P.C., concentrates its practice in complex litigation involving violations of federal and state securities, consumer-protection and antitrust laws, and litigates cases in federal and state courts throughout the country. The Firm has played a prominent role in many of the leading cases in these fields and is currently serving as lead or co-lead counsel in *Leibovic v. United Shore Financial Services, LLC*, 15-cv-12639 (E.D. Mich. 2015) (alleging failure to protect customers' private data and information); *In re Class 8 Truck Transmission Indirect Purchaser Antitrust Litigation*, 11-cv-00009 (D. Del. 2009) (alleging an antitrust conspiracy in the market for linehaul truck transmissions); *Kaufman v. CVS Caremark Corp.*, 14-cv-00216 (D. R.I. 2014) (alleging false and misleading statements in the sale and packaging of vitamin E); *Bradach v. Pharmavite*, 14-cv-03218 (C.D. Cal.) (alleging false and misleading statements in the sale and packaging of vitamin E), *Spence v. Basic Research LLC, et al.*, 14-cv-4945 (S.D.N.Y.) (alleging false advertising of weight loss pills); *Afzal v. BMW of North America, LLC*, Case No. 15-08009 (D.N.J.) (alleging product defect leading to catastrophic engine failure), and *Yao Yi Liu v. Wilmington Trust Company*, 14-cv-06631 (W.D.N.Y.) (alleging breach of fiduciary duty and aiding and abetting a Ponzi scheme).

The Firm is also serving as one of class counsel in several other prominent class actions, including: *In re Intuit Data Litigation*, 15-cv-1778 (N.D. Cal. 2015) (executive committee member); *In re Nexium (Esomeprazole) Antitrust Litigation* (D. Mass. 2012) (executive committee member); *In Re NHL Concussion Litigation* (D. Minn. 2014) (executive committee

member); *In re Community Health Systems, Inc. Customer Data Security Breach Litigation*, 15-cv-222 (N.D. Ala. 2015) (executive committee member); *In re Target Corporation Customer Data Security Breach Litig.* (D. Minn. 2014) (complaint committee); *In re Air Cargo Antitrust Litigation* (E.D.N.Y. 2006) (co-chair of the expert's committee); *In re Aftermarket Automotive Products Antitrust Litigation* (E.D. Mich. 2012); and *In re Ductile Iron Pipe Fittings (DIPF) Direct Purchaser Antitrust Litigation* (D.N.J. 2012).

The Firm has played prominent roles in numerous other class actions, including: *In re Air Cargo Antitrust Litigation* (co-chair of the expert's committee; partial settlements of over \$1 billion); *In re Vitamins Antitrust Litigation* (settlements of over \$1.7 billion); *In re NASDAQ Antitrust Litigation* (settlements totaling \$1.1 billion); and *In re Brand Name Prescription Drugs Antitrust Litigation* (settlements of approximately \$700 million).

THE FIRM'S SHAREHOLDERS

MARK S. GOLDMAN. Since 1986, Mark Goldman has concentrated his practice in many different types of complex litigation, including cases involving violations of the federal securities and antitrust laws and state consumer protection statutes. Mr. Goldman served as co-lead counsel in a number of class actions brought against life insurance companies, challenging the manner in which premiums are charged during the first year of coverage. In the antitrust field, Mr. Goldman litigated several cases that led to recoveries exceeding \$1 billion each, for the benefit of the consumers and small businesses he represented, including *In re Air Cargo Antitrust Litigation*, Case No. 06-MD-1775 (E.D.N.Y. 2016), *In re Vitamins Antitrust Litigation*, MDL No. 1285 (D.D.C. 1999), *In re NASDAQ Antitrust Litigation*, Case No. 94-cv-3996 (S.D.N.Y. 1994), and *In re Brand Name Prescription Drugs Antitrust Litigation*, Case No. 94-c-897 (N.D. Ill. 1994). Mr. Goldman currently represents numerous victims of identity theft seeking to hold

accountable companies that failed to protect the safety of private data maintained on their networks, including *In re Community Health Systems, Inc. Customer Data Security Breach Litigation*, 15-cv-222 (N.D. Ala. 2015), *In re Anthem, Inc. Data Breach Litigation*, Case No. 15-MD-02617-LHK (N.D. Cal. 2015), *In re Intuit Data Litigation*, 15-cv-1778 (N.D. Cal. 2015), and *In re Medical Informatics Engineering, Inc. Customer Data Security Breach Litigation*, MDL No. (N.D. Ind. 2015). In the area of securities litigation, Mr. Goldman played a prominent role in class actions brought under the antifraud provisions of the Securities Exchange Act of 1934, including *In re Nuskin Enterprises, Inc. Securities Litigation*, Master File No. 2:14-cv-00033 (D. Utah 2014), *In Re: Spectrum Pharmaceuticals, Inc. Securities Litigation*, Case No. 2:13-cv-00433 (D. Nev. 2013), and *In re Omnivision Technologies, Inc. Litigation*, Case No.: 5:11-cv-05235 (N.D. Cal. 2011). Mr. Goldman also prosecuted a number of insider trading cases brought against company insiders who, in violation of Section 16(b) of the Securities Exchange Act of 1934, engaged in short swing trading.

Mr. Goldman earned his undergraduate degree from the Pennsylvania State University in 1981 and his law degree from the University of Kansas School of Law in 1986. He is a member of the Pennsylvania bar.

PAUL J. SCARLATO. Paul Scarlato has concentrated his practice on the litigation of complex class actions since 1989. He has litigated numerous cases under the securities, consumer, antitrust and common law involving companies in a broad range of industries, and has litigated many cases involving financial and accounting fraud.

In securities fraud cases, Mr. Scarlato was one of three lead attorneys for the class in *Kaufman v. Motorola, Inc.*, a securities fraud class action that settled just weeks before trial, and along with Mr. Weinstein of his predecessor firm, was lead counsel in *Seidman v. American Mobile*

Systems, Inc., (E.D. Pa.), a securities class action that resulted in a settlement for the plaintiff class again on the eve of trial. Mr. Scarlato served as co-lead counsel in *In re: Corel Corporation Securities Litigation* (E.D. Pa.). Mr. Scarlato is currently one of the lead lawyers in *Leibovic v. United Shore Financial Services*; *Afzal v. BMW of North America, LLC*, and *Yao Yi Liu v. Wilmington Trust Company*. He is also counsel in *In re Platinum and Palladium Antitrust Litigation*, Case No. 14-cv-09391 (S.D.N.Y.), *In re Treasury Securities Auction Antitrust Litigation*, Case No. 15-md-02673 (S.D.N.Y.), and *In re Liquid Aluminum Sulfate Antitrust Litigation*, Case No. 15-7827 (D.N.J.).

Mr. Scarlato graduated from Moravian College in 1983 with a degree in accounting, and received his Juris Doctor degree from the Widener University School of Law in 1986. Mr. Scarlato served as law clerk to the Honorable Nelson Diaz, of the Court of Common Pleas of Philadelphia County, and thereafter as law clerk to the Honorable James T. McDermott, Justice of the Pennsylvania Supreme Court. After his clerkships, and prior to becoming a litigator, Mr. Scarlato was a member of the tax department of a major accounting firm where he provided a broad range of accounting services to large business clients in a variety of industries.

Mr. Scarlato is a member of the bars of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and the State of New Jersey, and those of various federal district and circuit courts.

BRIAN D. PENNY. Since joining the Firm in 2002, Mr. Penny has focused his practice on class action litigation principally in the areas of antitrust, consumer protection and securities fraud litigation. He was lead counsel in *Mirakay v. Dakota Growers Pasta Co.* (D.N.J. 2013) (alleging false and misleading advertising of pasta products and resulting in a settlement valued at over \$23 million); *Logue v. West Penn Multi-Listing Service* (W.D. Pa. 2010) (alleging price-fixing among brokers and multi-listing service and resulting in \$2.75 million settlement); *Allan*

v. Realcomp II (E.D. Mich. 2010) (alleging price-fixing among brokers and multi-listing service and resulting in a \$3.25 million settlement); *Boland v. Columbia Multi-Listing Service* (D.S.C. 2009) (alleging price-fixing among brokers and multi-listing service and resulting in a \$1 million settlement); *Robertson v. Hilton-Head Multi-Listing Service* (D.S.C. 2009) (alleging price-fixing among brokers and multi-listing service).

Mr. Penny is currently serving as lead or interim co-lead counsel in *In re Class 8 Truck Transmission Indirect Purchaser Antitrust Litigation*, 11-cv-00009 (D.Del. 2009) (alleging antitrust conspiracy in the market for linehaul truck transmissions); *Kaufman v. CVS Caremark Corp.*, (D. R.I. 2014) (alleging false and misleading advertising of vitamin E); *Bradach v. Pharmavite, et. al.* (C.D. Cal. 2014) (alleging false and misleading advertising of vitamin E) and *Spence v. Basic Research LLC, et al.*, 14-cv-4945 (S.D.N.Y.) (alleging false advertising of weight loss pills). Mr. Penny is currently serving on the executive committees in *In re Nexium (Esomeprazole) Antitrust Litigation* (D. Mass. 2012) (alleging generic suppression claims on behalf of end-payors), *In Re NHL Concussion Litigation* (D. Minn. 2014) (alleging league failed to protect players from known risks of concussions), and *In re: Community Health Systems, Inc., Customer Security Data Breach Litigation* (N.D. Ala. 2015) (alleging damages caused by data breach of health care records). He is also on the Third Party Discovery Committee in *In re Disposable Contact Lenses Antitrust Litigation*, 15-md-2626 (M.D. Fla.), and is actively engaged as class counsel in *In re Ductile Iron Pipe Fittings (DIPF) Direct Purchaser Antitrust Litigation* (D.N.J. 2012) (alleging price fixing in the market for DIPF); and *In re Target Corporation Customer Data Security Breach Litig.* (D. Minn. 2014) (alleging damages stemming from massive data breach).

Mr. Penny has also prosecuted numerous securities fraud class actions over the course of his career. He was a key member of the plaintiffs' teams that prosecuted *In re Broadcom Securities Litigation*, which resulted in a settlement of \$150 million for the class, and *AOL Time Warner Securities Litigation*, which resulted in a settlement of over \$2.5 billion for investors. Mr. Penny was also one of the lead attorneys representing the classes in a number of securities fraud actions arising out of stock option backdating, including, *In re Monster Worldwide, Inc. Securities Litigation* (\$47.5 million settlement), *In re Mercury Interactive Securities Litigation* (\$117.5 million settlement), *In re SafeNet, Inc. Securities Litigation* (\$25 million settlement), *Ramsey v. MRV Communications et al.* (\$10 million settlement), and *In re Semtech Securities Litigation* (\$20 million settlement).

Mr. Penny received his Bachelor of Arts degree from Davidson College, Davidson, North Carolina, in 1997 and earned his Juris Doctor degree from Pennsylvania State University in 2000. After graduating from law school, Mr. Penny served as law clerk to the Honorable John T.J. Kelly, Jr., Senior Judge of the Superior Court of Pennsylvania. He has been named a Super Lawyer or Rising Star each year since 2010. In 2015, Mr. Penny was one of four finalists for the American Antitrust Institute's Enforcement Award for Outstanding Antitrust Litigation Achievement by a Young Lawyer for his work on *Allen, et al. v. Realcomp Ltd., et al.*

THE FIRM'S ASSOCIATES

LAURA KILLIAN MUMMERT. Ms. Mummert earned her Bachelor of Science degree from the Pennsylvania State University and her Juris Doctor from the Dickinson School of Law of the Pennsylvania State University. She practices primarily in the areas of securities-fraud and consumer class action litigation. Currently, she is prosecuting consumer fraud actions involving unauthorized charges for frequent flier miles by car rental companies; misleading statements in

the sale of vitamin E, antitrust cases in markets for automotive sheetmetal and truck transmission, and a securities-fraud class action against a biotech company alleged to have misrepresented the status of clinical trials concerning two of its flagship products and a securities fraud class action against a worldwide publisher, developer and distributor of interactive entertainment software alleged to have misrepresented the content of one of its video games and accused of stock options backdating. During law school, Ms. Mummert authored, *Concerned or Just Plain Nosy? The Consequences of Parental Wiretapping Under the Federal Wiretap Act in Light of Pollock v. Pollock*, 104 DICK. L. REV. 561 (2000).

DOUGLAS J. BENCH, JR. Mr. Bench earned his Bachelor of Arts degree from the University of Pittsburgh and his Juris Doctor from Cornell Law School. Prior to joining the Firm in 2012, Mr. Bench served as a Death Penalty Law Clerk for the U.S. District Court in the Western District of Pennsylvania from 2010-2012. He was in private practice from 2008-2010 in Johnstown, Pennsylvania, and taught undergraduate macro and micro economics at the University of Pittsburgh, Johnstown campus, from 2006-2008.

As a result of his economics background, Mr. Bench is naturally interested in antitrust violations, consumer fraud, and the market inefficiencies these violations engender. Mr. Bench primarily focuses on antitrust and consumer class actions. Representative cases include: *Kaufman v. CVS Caremark Corp.*, (D. R.I. 2014) (alleging consumer protection violations); *Weintraub v. Pharmavite*, (C.D. Cal. 2014) (same); *Mirakay v. Dakota Growers Pasta Co., Inc.* (D. N.J. 2013) (alleging unfair trade practices and false advertising); *In re Nexium (Esomeprazole) Antitrust Litigation* (D. Mass. 2012) (alleging generic suppression claims on behalf of end-payors); *In re Ductile Iron Pipe Fittings (DIPF) Direct Purchaser Antitrust Litigation* (D.N.J. 2012) (alleging price fixing in the market for DIPF); *Allan v. Realcomp II*

(E.D. Mich. 2010) (alleging antitrust violations) (\$3.25M settlement pending approval); *Boland v. Columbia Multi-Listing Service* (D.S.C. 2009) (antitrust) (\$1M settlement); *Robertson v. Hilton-Head Multi-Listing Service* (D.S.C. 2009) (antitrust) (settled on claims-paid basis).

Mr. Bench has authored the following law review articles: Douglas J. Bench, *Collateral Review of Career Offender Sentences: The Case for Coram Nobis*, 45 U. MICH. J. L. REFORM 155 (2011); Douglas J. Bench, *What Constitutes a Violent Felony After Begay?*, 67 J. MO. B. 209 (2011).

EXHIBIT B

IN RE: LITHIUM ION BATTERIES INDIRECT
REPORTED HOURS AND LODESTAR AT CURRENT HOURLY RATES

Firm Name: Goldman Scarlato & Penny, P.C.

Reporting Period: June 1, 2013 through February 28, 2017

Categories:

- (1) Investigations, Factual Research
(2) Drafting Discovery Requests
(3) Drafting Discovery Answers/Responses
(4) Deposition Taking
(5) Deposition Defending
(6) Discovery Meet & Confer
(7) Document Review

- (8) Drafting Pleadings, Briefs & Pretrial Motions
(9) Reading/Reviewing Pleadings, Briefs, Discovery, Transcripts, etc.
(10) Class Certification/Experts
(11) Litigation Strategy, Analysis & Case Management
(12) Negotiating Settlements
(13) Trial and Trial Preparation
(14) Court Appearance and Prep

- (P) Partner
(A) Associate
(LC) Law Clerk
(PL) Paralegal
(L) Librarian

ATTORNEYS	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	TOTAL HOURS	CURRENT HOURLY RATE	TOTAL LODESTAR
Daniel R. Karon (P)							1.50				0.80				2.30	\$690.00	\$1,587.00
Robert W. Biela							468.20								468.20	\$350.00	\$163,870.00
Name (P)															0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
Name (OC)															0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
Name (A)															0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
															0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
SUB-TOTAL	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	469.70	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.80	0.00	0.00	0.00	470.50		\$165,457.00
NON-ATTORNEYS																	
Name (PL)															0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
Name (LC)															0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
															0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
															0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
															0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
															0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
SUB-TOTAL	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00		\$0.00
GRAND TOTAL:	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	469.70	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.80	0.00	0.00	0.00	470.50		\$165,457.00

EXHIBIT C

EXHIBIT C

In re Lithium Ion Batteries Antitrust Litigation

Goldman Scarlato & Penny , P.C.

[illegible]

EXHIBIT D

(REDACTED)

EXHIBIT D

**Lithium Ion Batteries Antitrust Litigation
Goldman Scarlato & Penny, P.C.
Time Report
June 1, 2013 through February 28, 2017**

Client	Attorney	Date	Description	Hours	Value
<u>Timekeeper: Biela</u>					
Indirect Batteries	Biela	10/23/2014	Document discovery - Review case materials and sign confidentiality agreement	5.50	\$1,925.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	10/28/2014	Document discovery - Conference call and review case materials	3.00	\$1,050.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	10/29/2014	Document discovery - Set up review platform and T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	10/30/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	7.50	\$2,625.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	10/31/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	6.00	\$2,100.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/3/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	7.00	\$2,450.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/4/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel; conference call with lead counsel re hot docs, review progress, other issues re production	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/5/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	7.00	\$2,450.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/6/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	6.50	\$2,275.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/7/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	6.50	\$2,275.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/8/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	4.00	\$1,400.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/9/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	3.50	\$1,225.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/10/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/11/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	5.30	\$1,855.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/12/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	1.50	\$525.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/13/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	6.50	\$2,275.00

EXHIBIT D

Lithium Ion Batteries Antitrust Litigation
Goldman Scarlato & Penny, P.C.
Time Report
June 1, 2013 through February 28, 2017

Client	Attorney	Date	Description	Hours	Value
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/14/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	7.20	\$2,520.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/15/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	4.00	\$1,400.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/17/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/18/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel; conference call with lead counsel re hot docs, review progress, other issues re production	7.50	\$2,625.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/19/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code Sony documents produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/20/2014	Document discovery - T1 review and code of "Panasonic English" batch documents assigned to me by lead counsel; elevated to T2 status; T2 review and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	4.50	\$1,575.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/21/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	7.50	\$2,625.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/23/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	3.00	\$1,050.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/24/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/25/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel; conference call with lead counsel re hot docs, review progress, other issues re production	7.00	\$2,450.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/26/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	5.80	\$2,030.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/28/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	7.20	\$2,520.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/29/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	6.00	\$2,100.00

EXHIBIT D

Lithium Ion Batteries Antitrust Litigation
Goldman Scarlato & Penny, P.C.
Time Report
June 1, 2013 through February 28, 2017

Client	Attorney	Date	Description	Hours	Value
Indirect Batteries	Biela	11/30/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	2.00	\$700.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/1/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	5.00	\$1,750.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/2/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel; conference call with lead counsel re hot docs, review progress, other issues re production	5.00	\$1,750.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/3/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	7.00	\$2,450.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/4/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	7.00	\$2,450.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/5/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	7.50	\$2,625.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/6/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	4.50	\$1,575.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/7/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel; conference call with lead counsel re hot docs, review progress, other issues re production	3.00	\$1,050.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/8/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/9/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.; conference call with lead counsel re hot docs, review progress, other issues re production	7.70	\$2,695.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/10/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	6.00	\$2,100.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/11/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	7.00	\$2,450.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/13/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	5.00	\$1,750.00

EXHIBIT D

Lithium Ion Batteries Antitrust Litigation
Goldman Scarlato & Penny, P.C.
Time Report
June 1, 2013 through February 28, 2017

Client	Attorney	Date	Description	Hours	Value
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/14/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	1.50	\$525.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/15/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	7.50	\$2,625.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/16/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel; conference call with lead counsel re hot docs, review progress, other issues re production	7.00	\$2,450.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/17/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	7.20	\$2,520.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/18/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of "Sony English Second" set docs produced to DOJ per batches assigned to me by lead counsel.	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/19/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	7.00	\$2,450.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/20/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	1.00	\$350.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/21/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	2.00	\$700.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/22/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	7.50	\$2,625.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/23/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel; conference call with lead counsel re hot docs, review progress, other issues re production	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/24/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	6.50	\$2,275.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/26/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/27/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	6.00	\$2,100.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/28/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	4.50	\$1,575.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/29/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	6.00	\$2,100.00

EXHIBIT D

Lithium Ion Batteries Antitrust Litigation
Goldman Scarlato & Penny, P.C.
Time Report
June 1, 2013 through February 28, 2017

Client	Attorney	Date	Description	Hours	Value
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/30/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	12/31/2014	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	6.00	\$2,100.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/2/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	7.00	\$2,450.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/3/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code of Sony liability docs per batches assigned to me by lead counsel	4.00	\$1,400.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/5/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0002 and Sony E Complaint - 0003	6.00	\$2,100.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/6/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0002 and Sony E Complaint - 0003; attend weekly status conference	6.00	\$2,100.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/7/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0002 and Sony E Complaint - 0003	6.00	\$2,100.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/8/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0002 and Sony E Complaint - 0003; emails to/from lead counsel re technical issues	6.00	\$2,100.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/9/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0002 and Sony E Complaint - 0003	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/12/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0015 and Sony E Complaint - 0016; email to lead counsel re same	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/13/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0015 and Sony E Complaint - 0016; attend weekly status conference	6.30	\$2,205.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/14/2015	Document discovery - T2 review and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0015 and Sony E Complaint - 0016	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/15/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0015 and Sony E Complaint - 0016; emails to/from lead counsel re coding procedures	7.00	\$2,450.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/16/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0015 and Sony E Complaint - 0016	8.00	\$2,800.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/18/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0015 and Sony E Complaint - 0016	7.50	\$2,625.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/20/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0015 and Sony E Complaint - 0016; attend weekly status conference	8.00	\$2,800.00

EXHIBIT D

Lithium Ion Batteries Antitrust Litigation
Goldman Scarlato & Penny, P.C.
Time Report
June 1, 2013 through February 28, 2017

Client	Attorney	Date	Description	Hours	Value
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/22/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0015 and Sony E Complaint - 0016	10.50	\$3,675.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/23/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - Batches Sony E Complaint - 0015 and Sony E Complaint - 0016; [REDACTED] [REDACTED]	5.00	\$1,750.00
Indirect Batteries	Biela	1/24/2015	Document discovery - [REDACTED] and code Sony documents - finish Batches Sony E Complaint - 0015 and Sony E Complaint - 0016	3.00	\$1,050.00
Total: Biela				468.20	\$163,870.00
<u>Timekeeper: Karon</u>					
Indirect Batteries	Karon	7/1/2013	Case Management/Strategy - Read and review email from lead counsel	0.20	\$138.00
Indirect Batteries	Karon	1/23/2014	Case Management/Strategy - read and review email from lead counsel; email co-counsel	0.20	\$138.00
Indirect Batteries	Karon	4/16/2014	Case Management/Strategy - Read and review letter from lead counsel; email lead counsel	0.20	\$138.00
Indirect Batteries	Karon	8/11/2014	Document discovery - Set up document review; telephone conference with lead counsel; telephone conference with co-counsel	1.50	\$1,035.00
Indirect Batteries	Karon	9/19/2014	Case Management/Strategy - Read and review letter from lead counsel	0.20	\$138.00
Total: Karon				2.30	\$1,585.00
Grand Total				470.50	\$165,457.00